

CAPITAL AREA TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY  
BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING

WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 21, 2022  
4:00 P.M. – LANSING CENTER GOVERNOR'S ROOM  
333 E. MICHIGAN AVENUE, LANSING, MI 48933

**PRESENT:** Nathan Triplett, Chair  
Dusty Fancher, Vice Chair  
Shanna Draheim, Secretary/Treasurer  
Mark Grebner  
Jack Schmitt  
John Prush  
Doug Lecato  
Jennie Gies  
Terrance Augustine

**CALL TO ORDER:**

Nathan Triplett, Chair called meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL:** Terrance Augustine, Shanna Draheim, Dusty Fancher, Jennie Gies, Mark Grebner, Doug Lecato, John Prush, Jack Schmitt, and Nathan Triplett were all present.

**ABSENT:** Phil Deschaine, Derek Melot and Maggie Sanders

Chair Triplett welcomed everyone to the Board meeting. He also mentioned that the meeting is being offered on Zoom for those who wish to view the Board meeting virtually.

Chair Triplett requested a moment of silence in memory of Board member, Robin Lewis who recently passed away.

Chair Triplett stated that Robin Lewis was a CATA Board member for thirteen years and served alongside him from 2009-2018, representing the City of Lansing and then rejoined the Board after relocating to Meridian Township and served from 2020 until her passing in 2022. Ms. Lewis always put the community first and served in many other ways including being elected to the Haslett Board of Education in November but unfortunately was not able to serve due to her untimely passing. Chair Triplett expressed that she will be deeply missed as a member of this Board, by the community and as a friend.

Chair Triplett welcomed others to share their thoughts at this time.

Shanna Draheim shared a story of Ms. Lewis and expressed what a warm and welcoming person she was.

Jennie Gies echoed Ms. Draheim's remarks and stated that Ms. Lewis was always willing to give a hug and was very welcoming. Ms. Gies expressed her deepest condolences to Ms. Lewis' family.

Doug Lecato also echoed remarks made by fellow Board members. He stated that he served many years on the Board with Ms. Lewis and he appreciated her support and friendship.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

Deb Parrish expressed her deepest sympathy for Ms. Lewis and shared a story of Ms. Lewis' thoughtfulness and compassion. Ms. Parrish also commented on paratransit and shared a story about Richard Clay, a representative from the National Federation of the Blind.

Deb Wiese, LAC Chair, offered her condolences for Ms. Lewis. Ms. Wiese also spoke about the LAC's role in the community and their partnership with CATA. Ms. Wiese thanked Nicole Wilson, Craig Frazier, and Bradley Funkhouser for inviting the LAC to take part in the paratransit contractor procurement process and felt that their comments and concerns were well received. Ms. Wiese further explained that along with fellow LAC member Erin Shannon, they reviewed the proposals and primarily focused on customer service, disability awareness training and retention of drivers.

Jennie Hardwood-Schlaack, a driver who has worked for Transdev for sixteen years, expressed her frustration with Transdev and the treatment of their employees. She also commented on Transdev's vehicles and wishes that they had better communication between the drivers and management.

Mary Mullins, a past Transdev employee and ATU representative, expressed her frustration with Transdev and the way they treat their employees. Ms. Mullins also shared a story about Transdev's payroll issues and an email from Corey Lee, a past employee of Transdev.

Mark Wetterstrom expressed his frustration with Transdev and their management. He explained that he has contacted Transdev's corporate office to speak about certain issues, yet he hasn't had any of his concerns addressed.

**CHAIR'S COMMENTS:**

**MOTION:**

Shanna Draheim motioned to excuse Phil Deschaine, Derek Melot and Maggie Sanders and Doug Lecato supported the motion.

**VOTE:** The motion carried unanimously.

Chair Triplett acknowledged a tile given to each Board member commemorating CATA's 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary. The tile was designed by local artist Kimberly Lavon and CATA staff.

## **CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S REPORT**

Bradley Funkhouser welcomed Transdev employees, members from the LAC and the public. He also offered his deepest condolences for Ms. Lewis and her family. Mr. Funkhouser stated that Ms. Lewis was a kind soul that was able to get things done. She will be deeply missed.

### **Job Fair**

Bradley Funkhouser announced that CATA will host a regional job fair on Thursday, January 19<sup>th</sup>. Representatives from Transdev will be on-site recruiting and the event will take place at the same time in three (3) different locations including, Ingham County, Eaton County and Clinton County.

### **EATRAN**

Bradley Funkhouser reported that EATRAN has released an RFP for a study of transportation needs and a new service plan. The results of the survey will help support regional coordination. More details to come.

### **Update on Clinton Transit's Cross-Boundary**

Bradley Funkhouser deferred to Dustin Hagfors, Director of Planning, for more details.

Dustin Hagfors explained that he and his team have monthly meetings with Clinton Transit to review their cross-boundary trips. Mr. Hagfors reported that the data shows that 75% of the cross-boundary trips provided by Clinton Transit have been for work or medical appointments. He also stated that there haven't been any drastic changes in the data since the cross-boundary agreement was amended.

### **January Retreat**

Bradley Funkhouser stated that the retreat in January will follow the same format as last year.

### **Listening Sessions**

Bradley Funkhouser shared that, starting in January, CATA will hold new listening sessions where staff will be available to speak directly to front line employees. Mr. Funkhouser stressed the importance of having a clear and consistent message along with hearing from all employees.

Dusty Fancher appreciated the Clinton Transit update and inquired about the number of trips.

Dustin Hagfors stated that he doesn't have the exact number; however, it is approximately a thousand trips per month.

## **ACTION ITEMS – PROPOSED CONSENT AGENDA**

- A. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 16, 2022, BOARD MEETING

B. TREASURER’S REPORT FOR OCTOBER 2022

1. Interim Income Statement
2. Cash Summary
3. Investments
4. Fifth Third Investment Account Reconciliation

C. INSURANCE RENEWALS

**PROPOSED MOTION:** That the CATA Board of Directors approves CATA’s purchase of insurance policies at quoted contract rates with the indicated premiums and authorizes the Chief Executive Officer, Bradley T. Funkhouser, to execute such applications, contracts, and other documents as are necessary and appropriate to bind and perfect such insurance coverage and services for the period from December 1, 2022, through November 30, 2023.

D. CONTRACT FOR PARATRANSIT DEMAND RESPONSE SERVICES

**PROPOSED MOTION:** That the CATA Board of Directors authorizes Board Chair, Nathan Triplett, and Chief Executive Officer, Bradley T. Funkhouser, to execute a contract with Transdev Services, Inc., for a three-year term with two (2), one-year options, to provide paratransit services on such other terms and conditions as the Board Chair and the Chief Executive Officer deem necessary at the following rates and estimated cost:

<u>Year</u>	<u>Vehicle Service Hour Rate</u>		<u>Estimated Cost</u>
	<u>Spec-Tran</u>	<u>Supplemental</u>	
1	\$74.06	\$74.06	\$9,585,285.58
2	\$76.76	\$76.76	\$9,934,875.06
3	\$80.08	\$80.08	\$10,364,545.52
4	\$83.87	\$83.87	\$10,854,513.18
5	\$87.15	\$87.15	\$11,280,033.72
Total			\$52,019,253.06

E. SYSTEMWIDE PUBLIC SAFETY AND POLICE SERVICE

**PROPOSED MOTION:** That the CATA Board of Directors authorizes Board Chair Nathan Triplett and Chief Executive Officer Bradley T. Funkhouser, to approve payments to the City of Lansing Police Department in the amount of \$63,630 for the period of January 1, 2023, through September 30, 2023; followed by a second payment in the amount of \$87,169, effective October 1, 2023, through September 30,

2024. The total cost of services through September 30, 2024, is projected at \$150,799, which will ensure continued police presence and support at the CATA Transportation Center, and public and internal meetings; aboard buses; and throughout the CATA system within LPD's jurisdiction.

Chair Triplett stated that Action Item D, Contract for Paratransit Demand Response Services will be moved to the Discussion Agenda.

**MOTION:**

Shanna Draheim motioned to approve the Consent Agenda with item D, CONTRACT FOR PARATRANSIT DEMAND RESPONSE SERVICES moved to discussion. Jennie Gies supported the motion.

**VOTE:** The motion carried unanimously.

**ACTION ITEM - DISCUSSION AGENDA**

A. CONTRACT FOR PARATRANSIT DEMAND RESPONSE SERVICES

**PROPOSED MOTION:** That the CATA Board of Directors authorizes Board Chair, Nathan Triplett, and Chief Executive Officer, Bradley T. Funkhouser, to execute a contract with Transdev Services, Inc., for a three-year term with two (2), one-year options, to provide paratransit services on such other terms and conditions as the Board Chair and the Chief Executive Officer deem necessary at the following rates and estimated cost:

<u>Year</u>	<u>Vehicle Service Hour Rate</u>		<u>Estimated Cost</u>
	<u>Spec-Tran</u>	<u>Supplemental</u>	
1	\$74.06	\$74.06	\$9,585,285.58
2	\$76.76	\$76.76	\$9,934,875.06
3	\$80.08	\$80.08	\$10,364,545.52
4	\$83.87	\$83.87	\$10,854,513.18
5	\$87.15	\$87.15	<u>\$11,280,033.72</u>
Total			<u>\$52,019,253.06</u>

Chair Triplett gave the floor to Mr. Funkhouser.

Bradley Funkhouser noted that the Transdev contract is one of the largest contracts that CATA has and CATA has a great responsibility in meeting the demands of the Board as well as the community. Mr. Funkhouser then introduced Andrew Brieschke, Deputy CEO, to lead the presentation.

Andrew Brieschke shared some history between CATA and Transdev. He reported on

Transdev's partnership with CATA, their performance, and the procurement process. He noted that Transdev's overall on-time performance over a five (5) year time span was at 93%. Complaints are closed in a timely manner and Transdev's General Manager, Nancy Lohr, communicates regularly with CATA's Paratransit Manager, Craig Frazier. Mr. Brieschke explained that during the pandemic, CATA was forced to make some changes and Transdev was able to step-in and provide assistance with the Redi-Ride service which otherwise would have had to be shut down for a period of time. He also commented on the vehicle status and confirmed that both CATA and Transdev's maintenance teams perform regular spot checks on all vehicles. Transdev representatives are also present at CATA's job fairs and all-operator training.

Shanna Draheim asked for confirmation on Transdev's on-time performance rating.

Andrew Brieschke confirmed that Transdev had a 93% on-time performance rating over a five (5) year time span across all service types.

Mark Grebner inquired whether Dean Transportation submitted a proposal.

Andrew Brieschke stated that Dean Transportation appeared at the pre-proposal meeting but did not submit a proposal.

Mark Greber wondered if Transdev's performance rating was similar to when CATA had a contract with Dean Transportation.

Andrew Brieschke stated that Transdev's performance was very satisfactory.

Mark Grebner inquired about how the complaints are handled.

Andrew Brieschke stated that any complaints that CATA receives are handled by Mr. Frazier who then works with Ms. Lohr to solve.

Mark Grebner inquired about the number of complaints CATA receives pertaining to Transdev and whether that number is similar to the complaints received when CATA was partnered with Dean Transportation.

Craig Frazier confirmed that CATA receives somewhere between 25-50 complaints a year related to Transdev and that number is lower than complaints CATA received during our partnership with Dean Transportation.

Mark Grebner inquired whether CATA has any connection to Transdev's payroll issue.

Andrew Brieschke stated that Transdev has a Union and their management handles their own payroll.

Doug Lecato stated that the Transdev drivers are trying to do their job and even though this seems to be a management issue, they are transporting CATA riders and wonders if CATA can assist in any way to correct the situation.

Andrew Brieschke stated that CATA cannot get too involved in Transdev's management; however, CATA can assist with customer service and ridership. Mr. Brieschke noted that CATA and Transdev have monthly meetings to work out all issues.

Mark Grebner inquired about Transdev's number of rides per year.

Andrew Brieschke stated that all paratransit services transported about 500,000 rides per year before the pandemic, of which about 300,000 are Spec-Tran, and Transdev transports 70%-80% of those Spec-Tran trips.

Mark Grebner inquired about the types of service in the paratransit contract and whether CATA and Transdev share certain services.

Andrew Brieschke stated this new contract includes all the same types of service that Transdev already performs including CATA Rural Service, the Connector in Mason and in Williamston and Webberville, the Mason Redi-Ride and Spec-Tran. CATA directly operates the Delhi Redi-Ride, the Meridian Redi-Ride, and some Spec-Tran as well.

Mark Grebner confirmed that this is the same service as before.

Andrew Brieschke confirmed that the service is the same with the exception of some potential new cross-boundary trips.

Mark Grebner inquired about whether Transdev provides any services to MSU.

Andrew Brieschke stated that Transdev is responsible for the "Lot Link" and the "Night Owl" service.

Doug Lecato inquired about whether Transdev will be able to ramp-up service with a driver shortage.

Andrew Brieschke stated that CATA doesn't have any plans to ramp-up service at this time. Both Transdev and CATA have a driver shortage; however, with the job fairs and recruitment efforts, we anticipate being in a better position very soon.

Bradley Funkhouser recognized and thanked Craig Frazier, Paratransit Manager, for his work with Transdev.

Dusty Fancher inquired about the percentage of services that Transdev provides and whether CATA could take over those services.

Andrew Brieschke stated that Transdev provides about 70%-80% of paratransit ADA rides and CATA could not take over those rides.

Dusty Fancher inquired whether CATA would be at risk of losing federal funds if it

did not provide ADA services.

Andrew Brieschke confirmed that CATA would be at risk of losing federal funds and further explained that providing ADA complimentary paratransit service is a federal requirement for public transit agencies and that CATA is responsible for providing this service.

Dusty Fancher inquired whether CATA could be penalized for not providing ADA services.

Andrew Brieschke confirmed that CATA could be penalized and funding could be jeopardized.

Dusty Fancher expressed her appreciation for the LAC's involvement in the procurement process and their partnership. She also thanked them for attending the Board meeting.

**MOTION:**

Dusty Fancher motioned to approve Discussion Item A, CONTRACT FOR PARATRANSIT DEMAND RESPONSE SERVICES and Shanna Draheim supported the motion.

**DISCUSSION:**

Mark Grebner commented on the city of Detroit not renewing their contract with Transdev and losing their ADA service. He also shared his thoughts on paratransit service and the Transdev contract. Mr. Grebner also recognized CATA for the quality of service that they provide, and how it is significantly above the minimum levels required.

Jack Schmitt stated that he believes that the Board should move forward based on the information presented. He thanked the LAC for their involvement and commended the CATA staff and their process. Mr. Schmitt also recognized that the concerns presented during Public Comment are serious, yet he will stand by CATA's word that they will investigate and keep trying to do better.

Doug Lecato thanked CATA, the LAC, Transdev and the Transdev and CATA drivers. He also stressed that CATA is trying to provide the best service they can and uses the awarded funds responsibly. Mr. Lecato does believe that CATA and Transdev can do better and he hopes that the management at Transdev hears the complaints that were made today and takes responsibility to make things better.

Chair Triplett stated that it is important to know that when things are not 100%, we have fallen short of our objective and recognize that when things go wrong, we need to do better. He also agrees with the comments made by fellow Board members and will continue to address the issues brought forth and do our best to correct them.

**VOTE:** The motion carried unanimously.

**OLD BUSINESS**

None

**NEW BUSINESS**

None

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

Deb Parrish expressed that she was excited to see the CATApillar and the Ladybus at the Silver Bells parade. She also commented on the call-takers at CATA and wondered if there would be less mistakes if they were not working remotely.

Jason Best, a CATA rider for 28 years, commented on the Transdev contract and CATA's ability to investigate certain issues. Mr. Best inquired about who is in charge of picking up trash at CATA's stops and also shared a story about the driver shortage.

Jennie Harwood-Schlaack hopes that service will continue and get better. She would like to work with Transdev in order to solve issues and have better communication between management and employees. Ms. Harwood-Schlaack also commented on the condition of Transdev's vehicles.

Mary Mullins also commented on the condition of Transdev's vehicles and the way they treat their employees.

Chair Triplett thanked everyone for attending and wished everyone a safe and Happy Holiday.

**ADJOURNMENT**

**MOTION:**

Dusty Fancher motioned to adjourn the meeting and Doug Lecato supported the motion.

**VOTE:** The motion carried unanimously.

Chair Triplett adjourned the meeting at 5:14 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Shanna Draheim  
Secretary/Treasurer

Tina Orlando  
Recording Secretary